एक्जामिनेशंस चल रहे हैं, उनका लेखा-जोखा चल रहा है और उसमें कुछ छानबीन की जा रही है इसलिए अभी फिलहाल बंद है ।

SHRIMATI VEENA VERMA: Sir, for two years no grant has been given by the Department of Culture.

दो साल से उनको कोई ग्रांट नहीं मिली है । 87-88 तक मिली है ।

श्री सभापति : यह बता दीजिए कि इससे यह प्रश्न नहीं उठता ।

श्रीमती कृष्णा साही : इसके लिए अलग से प्रश्न किया जाए ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : ग्रामीण पुस्तकालयों की हालत बहुत अधिक खराब है । यह बात सही है कि लाइब्रेरी स्टेट लिस्ट में है लेकिन गांव जो है जो भारत के हैं वहां राज्य के भी हैं उसको देखते हुए ग्रामीण समुदाय को ज्यादा एनलाइटन करने के लिए मेरा अनुरोध है । एक तो सती कांड हो रहा है, हरिजनों पर जुल्म हो रहे हैं उसको देखते हुए क्या सरकार इस पर फिर से विचार करेगी कि ग्रामीण लाइब्रेरी को आवश्यक अनुदान ग्रांट की जाए और आधुनिक बनाया जाए इस पर क्या सरकार विचार करेगी ?

श्री सभापति : यह जो प्रश्न है यह पुस्तकालयों को कान्करेंट लिस्ट में लाने के बारे में है । क्या आप कांक्रेट लिस्ट के खिलाफ हैं?

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैंने पूछा है कि इसके अलावा क्या सरकार इसपर भी विचार करेगी?

श्री सभापति : प्रश्न इससे उठता नहीं है । लेकिन मैंने इसलिए पूछने की इजाजत दे दी कि गांव की बात कर रहे थे।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : कंस्टीटयूशन में इसका प्रावधान करने के लिए सरकार विचार कर सकती है क्या? इसलिए मैंने सरकार से अनुरोध किया है कि वह पुनर्विचार करे ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Education is already in the Concurrent List.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Education is already in the Concurrent List and library belongs to non-formal education. So, the Minister is entitled to reply.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you telling that it is already in the Concurrent List?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Education is already in the ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am talking of the library.

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): My friend is slightly confusing the issue. Entry 12 of List II specifically refers to the libraries and when it comes to entry 62 of List I in the Union List, it is in a different form. Therefore, it is not non-formal education. That interpretation may not fit in here.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Constitutional experts will not agree.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि इसके न रहते हुए...

श्री सभापति : यह इससे उठता नहीं है । गांव की लाइब्रेरी की मदद कर सकते हैं क्या यह आप बता दीजिए ।

श्रीमती कृष्णा साही : वर्तमान परिस्थितियों में पुस्तकालय विषय को संघ/समवर्ती सूची में सम्मिलित करने का कोई भी प्रस्ताव विचाराधीन नहीं है ।

Procedure adopted for Awarding Catering Contracts for Indian Airlines and Air India

*122. DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI: Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM be pleased to state the names of the present catering contractors engaged by Indian Airlines and Air India and the procedure adopted for awarding the contracts to these caterers?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL): A statement giving the names of the present catering contractors of Indian Airlines and Air India is attached. (*See* Appendix CLI, Annexure No. 71].

As far as the procedure adopted for awarding contracts is concerned, in Indian Airlines contracts are mostly awarded on the basis of limited tender enquiries floated to all reputed hoteliers, generally of five star standard. In exceptional cases, catering contracts are also finalised against press tenders. At out-stations, where there is not more than one good caterer able to supply food items, contracts are awarded even against a single quotation. In all major cities, contracts are awarded to more than one caterer with a view to ensuring uninterrupted supplies, competition and quality.

In Air India, out of 27 stations, at 12 stations there is only one monopoly caterer available at each station. At such stations, contracts are awarded after negotiating prices. At the remaining stations catering contracts are awarded on the basis of quotations received and reviewed by the Tender Committee. The tender Committee submits its report to Headquarters and only after getting the letters approval, contracts are awarded to the selcaterers.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI: Sir, the answer of the hon. Minister is full of discretion to select contracts. At one place it says: "Generally of five star standard". I cannot understand this. That means it could also be of 3 or 4 star hotels. Then it says: "Contracts are mostly awarded on the basis of limited tender enquiries." The view expressed by the Government is not specific. Then it says: "Where there is not more than one good caterer able to supply food items, contracts are awarded even against a single quotation." In all these cases the answer is of a general nature, it is not specific. I would like to seek the answer of the hon. Minister in a more expressive form.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I could not follow you. Please put your supplementary clearly.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He has asked about the present catering contractors, whereas the Minister is talking in general terms.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI: Sir, I want a categorical reply. The Minister has mentioned "exceptional cases". What are these exceptional cases? Then he says, "generally five star standard". What does it mean? Could it be two star, one star or no star hotel.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So you want to know why from five star hotels and what does he mean by a five star hotel.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: And what is meant by "generally five star standard"?

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two points which you have to explain. What do you mean by 'five star' and why only 'five star' and why 'generally five star'? First give the definition of 'five star'.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: And whether the food supplied by the five star hotels is always good.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: At Delhi, Bombay, Madras and Calcutta we are collecting food from the hotels which are termed as five star hotels. Now what is a five star hotel, the definition has to be given. The definition is that they should have a particular kind of space in the rooms, a particular kind of catering arrangement, a swimming pool and many other things.

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH: Kindly explain these "many other things".

MR. CHAIRMAN: You asked for the definition of a five star hotel. He is giving the definition.

DR. BAPU KALDATE: But he is saying, "many other things". What are those "many other things"?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI RAJESH PILOT): The conclave meetings are held in these hotels. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is unfair to him. You asked a question about the definition of a five star hotel. He is defining it.

SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH: We want to know how many other things are covered along with the food.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I was under the impression that the hon. Members are interested in knowing about the quality of food and if any Member is interested in "other things", I can send a list of "other things".

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We are interested in the quality of food you supply.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: At international airports we have the catering facility provided by the airlines also and they are collecting the food material from Chefair Hotel which is run by the airlines. At these places, we are not dependent on only one source of food supply. We are collecting food from other renowned, well-known hoteliers also. The point is to collect good quality food and provide it to the passengers. At other places, there are no five star hotels. That is the definition given to a particular kind of hotel. So at other places there are no quality hotels and so we are collecting food from other hotels which are not five star hotels also. Food is collected from Lucknow and Benaras and other places also. So at those places, whatever source is available, we are trying to collect it... Wait a minute.

श्री सभापति: आप अपनी बात बाद में लिखकर दे दीजिये ।

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I have given the names of the hotels from which we are collecting food. There are categories of hotels. So from the best of the hotels available, we are trying to collect the food. Where the best of the hotels is not available, we are going in for the second best also.

DR. YELAMANCHILI SIVAJI: What is the amount spent per flight on lunch and food? Is there any commission or kick-back involved in it?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, the amount of money we are spending on getting the food for Indian Airlines is about Rs. 17 crores. The amount of money which we are spending on the food collected by Air-India is Rs. 34 crores because liquor and all those things are served on the international flights of Air-India. The break-up of the amount of money we are spending on breakfast, dinner and lunch is with me... (*Interruptions*)... For each person we were spending about Rs. 12.35 in 1984-85 and in 1988-89 we were spending about Rs. 17.40.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Sir, I am not in favour of five-star hotel food to be given on the airlines. It is just like a brand name. The prices of Bata shoes are very high as compared to better shoes available with others. So, I would like to know whether the Government will consider the alternative instead of serving five-star hotel food because of its high price compared to others who can give better food at a lower cost. I want to know whether he will consider this and, secondly, also whether Government would give preference to ITDC and other public sector hotels, wherever they are available. Sir, I have been to Trivandrum and there they have made a complaint that Indian Airlines are not giving them orders or are giving very meagre orders. I want to know whether they are given meagre orders and, if they have got the capacity, whether Go-

ernment would consider that first of all they would give orders to public sector companies which we want to go to the height which we want them to, and what action the Government is contemplating to take for that purpose. Wherever the public sector hotels are there, the food may not be as good, but I would like to know whether preference would be given by Air-India and Indian Airlines to them for that purpose.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is asking about ITDC which is also under you.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I am inclined to agree to half of the question put by my honourable friend here. Sir, the intention of the Government of India is to see that these public sector undertakings are utilized by other public sector undertakings also. So, we have kept them informed that they should try to collect food from the hotels which are run by public sector undertakings, but where public sector undertakings are not there, per force we have to take food from other hotels.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do you take it only when ITDC hotels are not available?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Yes, Sir, where ITDC hotels are not available. ..(*Interruptions*) . . . As far as Trivandrum is concerned, for the information of the honourable Member I would like to say that they are collecting food from the Trivandrum hotel also. But, at one place we are trying to have two sources. Suppose, for some reason the food is not available at one place, we try to get it from outside. Secondly, if the hotel is at a distance of, say, 20 kilometres from the airport, in transporting the food from the hotel to the airport the food gets stale and then people complain. That factor also we keep in mind. I agree that we would like to take food from all the public sector undertakings, but I would respectfully disagree that we would not like to serve second quality or poor quality food.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: I did not say like that.

श्री अश्विनी कुमार : सभापति महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहूंगा कि हवाई यात्रा में जो जलपान और भोजन देते हैं क्या उसकी एक स्टैंडर्ड कैलोरी जो होनी चाहिए उसको डिफाइन किया गया है, कितना कितना देते हैं, उसकी क्वालिटी क्या है? दूसरा, उसकी क्वालिटी की चेकिंग का जो स्टैंडर्ड है वह क्या है और उसकी क्वालिटी की चेकिंग की क्या प्रक्रिया है? महोदय, मेरा यह अनुभव है, जब हम दिल्ली से बिहार की ओर जाते हैं तो लखनऊ से जो खाना मिलता है, पटना से जो खाना मिलता है, रांची से जो खाना मिलता है और गुवहाटी से जो खाना मिलता है वह बहुत ही थर्ड क्लास होता है। मैं जितनी भी बार चला हूं उतनी बार मैंने कंपलेंट की है लेकिन उनका आज तक कोई जवाब नहीं आया है। मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहता हूं कि इसको समान स्तर लाने के लिये मंत्री महोदय क्या करेंगे?

श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी : मंत्री महोदय पोर्टफोलियो बदलेंगे और क्या करेंगे।

श्री शिवराज पाटिल : सभापति जी, मैं यह बताना चाहूंगा कि हमारे पास खाना दो प्रकार का आता है। कुछ एअरक्राफ्ट्स में खाना गर्म रखने की व्यवस्था रहती है वहां पर खाना गर्म रख कर दिया जाता है और कुछ एअरक्राफ्ट्स में खाना गर्म रखने की व्यवस्था नहीं होती है। जो खाना गर्म होता है उसके बारे में कम्पलेंट्स हमारे पास कम आती हैं और जो खाना ठंडा होता है उसके बारे में हमारे पास कम्पलेंट्स ज्यादा आती हैं। जो खाना दिल्ली, बम्बई कलकत्ता और मद्रास आदि एअरपोर्ट से

लिया जाता है स्टैंडर्ड होटल्ज से लिया जाता है उसके बारे में हमारे पास कम्पलेंट्स कम हैं । मगर जो खाना दूसरे स्टेशंस से लखनऊ, पटना वगैरह से आता है वहां के बारे में खाने की कम्पलेंट्स ज्यादा हैं । हमारी यह कोशिश होगी कि वहां के खाने के स्टैंडर्ड को भी अच्छा बनाया जाए । अब खाने की केलोरीज का जहां तक सम्बन्ध है मैं समझता हूं कि इसके लिए एक कमेटी बैठी हुई थी । उन्होंने सोचा है कि किस प्रकार का खाना देना है और क्या-क्या आइटम्स देने हैं, उसकी सूची है जैसे पुलाव है, दही है, सब्जी है (व्यवधान)

डा० बापू कालदाते : यह भोजन काल में बताइये ।

श्री शिवराज पाटिल : श्रीमन्, मैं यह चाहूंगा कि जहां तक हो सके यह होलसम हो और केलोरीज की दृष्टि से भी अच्छा हो यह देखा गया है मगर बिलकुल साइंटिफिकली केलकुलेट किया हुआ है या नहीं यह मैं पूछताछ कर के बताऊंगा । जो आइटम्स हैं उनकी एक पूरी लिस्ट है । जहां तक चेकिंग का सवाल है हमारा ऐसा प्रोसीजर है कि खाना जब वहां से निकलता है तो एट रेंडम उसको चेक करना चाहिए और चेक करने के लिए इंटरनेशनल एअरपोर्ट पर खास आदमी है मगर जहां पर खास आदमी नहीं है दूसरे एअरपोर्टस पर जब खाना लाते हैं तो वहां पर एअरपोर्ट मेनेजर वगैरह चेक करते हैं और दूसरी जगहों पर भी एक कमेटी जाती है ग्रुप आफ पर्सन्स जाता है वह चेक करता है । मैं यह नहीं कहता कि जो खाना मिलता है वह सारे लोगों की पसंद का होगा अच्छा होगा हमारी कोशिश जरूर है कि अच्छे से अच्छा खाना यात्रियों को दिया जाए । मगर आप भी थोड़ा इसे ध्यान में रखें कि हवाई जहाज में किसी में अढ़ाई सौ लोगों का खाना किसी में तीन सौ लोगों को खाना देना होता है और उस खाने को 10-10, 15-15 मील से भी लाना पड़ता है । खाने की क्वालिटी का जहां तक सम्बन्ध है दक्षिण के यात्री एक प्रकार का खाना चाहते हैं और उत्तर के यात्री दूसरी प्रकार का खाना चाहते हैं मगर मैं यह नहीं कहना चाहता हूं कि सब कुछ ठीक है । ठीक तो है ही हम और अच्छा बनाने की कोशिश करेंगे । हमारा यही प्रयास है ।

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister what steps are specifically being taken to improve the quality and the quantity of food served on flight especially from Calcutta? There are five star hotels in Calcutta but the food served on the flights is from third class or fourth class hotels. In view of the rapid expansion in the volume of air traffic, is it not possible for the three national air carriers to organise departmental catering especially at the metropolitan and other major airports?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: We are trying to get the food items from the well-known hotels at Calcutta also. We are taking food items from ITDC hotels and others hotels also. If the quality of food is not good we shall certainly take action and we shall try to see as to how good quality food can be provided. We have a procedure laid down. Every day we supply different items. This is done with a view to see that the material which is prepared today is not supplied tomorrow and things like that. Sir, here cooperation from the hoteliers and cooperation from so many other persons is also required. We have a public sector undertaking as well as private sector also and both of them provide us with good food and sometimes both of them give us a chance to complain against them also. We shall have to see the quality.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am not interested in five star hotels nor in a particular contractor. I am only interested in the quality and quantity of food supplied

to the pasengers. The Minister has replied that they are paying Rs. 17 crores on account of the food supplied to the passengers in the Indian Airlines. He will surely agree with me that this cost depends upon the source from which he is receiving the food. If you collect food from a five star hotel, they charge not only on the basis of quality which they serve but because of certain other infrastructure expenditure also. So the same food with a better quality can be made available from different hotels and other restaurants. Actually that is the main criteria and the should be followed by the Indian Airlines authorities, not simply the five star hotels, because the items which you buy from ITDC hotel or Samrat hotel or Airport hotel or any other big hotel, you will get the same item in a better quality and quantity and better service at a cheaper rate. So, naturally, Sir, I want to know whether they are going to review this particular policy of placing orders only with five star hotels not basing on the quality of the food. This is one aspect.

The second is how much Indian Airlines is spending per passenger on account of breakfast, lunch and dinner. Now, the fares for high class from Delhi to Calcutta or Calcutta to Delhi has gone up to Rs. 1600. May I know from the Minister how much of that he is spending on account of breakfast, lunch and dinner?

The third thing that I want to know is...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI MADHAV RAO SCINDIA): The question is going on so long...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Madhavrao Scindia, in the case of Railways also.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: His delivering a speech on the question. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The third question is that they are supplying both vegetarian and non-vegetarian food items. But nowadays Indian Airlines is supplying only vegetarian food and in the case of non-vegetarian food they add only one item of non-vegetarian which an is apology for non-vegetarian food. May I know from the Minister from when this policy is going to be changed?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You give only non-vegetarian and no vegetables.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I have already said that we are trying to get food items from the public sector hotels as far as possible where they are existing and where the public sector hotels are not there we shall have to ensure that good quality food is supplied. Supposing the standard of the hotel is not good, then, one does not know in what hygienic condition food is cooked and whether the food is wholesome or not. There are so many things. Supposing we give the orders to the hotels which are not standard hotels, then, it becomes very difficult. We take the standard of the hotel generally into account and then we will try to collect from them.

I have already said about the items being supplied on the flight, their quality, quantity and calories. I cannot give him all the details because it will take 10 more minutes which is not correct. I can give him in writing all the details. If specified quantity of food is not supplied on the flights we have been taking action against those people also and we are trying to maintain the quality of food.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What about non-vegetarian and vegetarian food?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What about per passenger expenditure on account of breakfast, lunch and dinner?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Whether cockroach is considered as non-vegetarian or not.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, it is about Rs. 18. So far as non-vegetarian and vegetarian food items are concerned, the plight of the Indian Airlines is very, very difficult. Some people only want vegetariain food not even the smell of the non-vegetarian food. Some people only want non-vegetarian food. Some people want hot quality of food. Some people want dishes which are cooked in South India and different varieties of dishes are asked for by the passengers and we are trying to cater... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, may I know from him whether he spends more on vegetarian or non-vegetarian items?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: We are spending more on vegetarian items because total vegetarian quantity of food supplied is more and we supply only one non-vegetarian item.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: There is only one non-vegetarian item.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: That is what I am saying... (*Interruptions*)... The main job of Air India and Indian Airlines is to transport people from one place to the other. Here, we are discussing the quality of food and the items of food which are generally discussed in the concerned department.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO: Mr. Chairman, Sir, while we are discussing Five Stars, Four Stars and all those stars hotels, the prime idea is that the supply of food by the Five Star hotel should be better than that of others. I would like to ask the Minister whether it has come to his notice—I say this, Sir, because I am a regular traveller and I am talking to him of the golden triangle—Calcutta, Madras and Bombay—on this triangle alone, the food supplied to the passengers on these flights five years back was far better than what is being supplied now and what remedial action he would take to bring it at least to that standard which was available five or six years back.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I do not know what quality of food was supplied five years back because I have not maintained that taste in my mouth. But I can assure the hon. Member that we will certainly put in more efforts to see that if the quality of the food is not good, we raise the quality of the food.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO: From Rs. 12/- you have gone to Rs. 17.60 now .... (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has given his reply. Mr. Minister, now, your answer is over.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, my question is, the Railways have a network of catering services throughout the country. Now, will the Minister for Civil Aviation consider taking supplies of food from the railway catering service so that either the railway catering service improves or the Airline catering service deteriorates further?

SHRI M. A. BABY: In that situation, Airlines will be affected by tornado.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I am very happy that you are satisfied with the railway catering service.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, I can vouchsafe that railway catering is far superior to what we get in Indian Airlines... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: If Mr. Salve is saying so and if it is the view of the entire House, we will certainly try to look into it and get the food from the Railway caterers.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: That is true of Rajdhani Express.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: I am not prepared to consider it.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Especially in Rajdhani Express, food is very well cooked.

Avoidance of mid-air collision between two Indian Airlines Boeings

*123. SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: †
SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:

Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the news item that a mid-air collision between two Indian Airlines Boeing 737s was averted, about 100 to 150 kilometres from Bombay on the 4th July, 1989; and

(b) if so, what action has been initiated by Government to avert such incidents?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL): (a) Government is aware of an airmiss between the two Indian Airlines B-737 aircraft in the controlled air space of Bombay airport on the 4th July, 1989.

(b) Air Traffic Controller involved in the incident has been withdrawn from active Air Traffic Control duties. Air Traffic Control Rating of the Air Traffic Controller involved in the incident has been suspended.

A plan for modernisation of the air traffic control system, installation of secondary surveillance radar at Bombay airport has been initiated.

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Kamal Morarka.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir, it is a shockingly fallous and careless answer to my question. The Minister admits that two Boeings nearly clashed. Does this House take cognizance only after 150 passengers are dead? If two Boeings clashed in the mid-air, more than 300 passengers would have been dead. And what is the answer I am getting? 'The Government is aware of the near-miss', as if it is something routine. And then what have you done? You have suspended one Air Traffic Controller. Action has been initiated to upgrade the equipment. I do not understand. We have spent so much time on the Airlines' food. But I am really very much concerned, for this is the state of safety. I do not think anybody will be travelling by Indian Airlines. I can understand such a thing in America where there is crowded sky. But in India, where there are hardly flights few and far between, a near-miss is understandable. It is inconceivable with Delhi-Mangalore flights. Something is seriously wrong with your entire air traffic control, with the training. I want a clarification for the answer. Have you found out whether the inquiry was initiated? Was that Air Traffic Controller an experienced chap or was he a novice? What is the whole system? Just don't tell us. "We are aware of the miss and one chap has been suspended." How do we know that it will not happen today, it will not happen again and again? You please give us a proper answer, Mr. Minister. Don't take the House for granted.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I should have a proper question to answer. If he wants to know whether the Air Traffic Controller is experienced or not, the answer is yes, he is experienced. Now, he has committed a mistake and we have taken action against him. This is a mistake committed by an individual who was sitting at the radar and the control system and we have taken action against him. It is not that he is a novice or that he is inexperienced or something like that.